



Recreation & Community Services Staff Report

Report Number: R06-2022
Report Title: Maryhill Fire Station Replacement
Author: Thomas van der Hoff, Manager of Operations and Projects
Meeting Type: Committee of the Whole Meeting
Meeting Date: May 30, 2022
eDocs or File ID: N/A
Consent Item: No
Final Version: Yes
Reviewed By: Richard Petherick, Director of Finance and Treasurer
Final Review: Chief Administrative Officer

Recommendation:

That the Council of the Township of Woolwich, considering Report R06-2022 respecting Maryhill Fire Station Replacement:

1. award Request for Proposal 2022-13 Maryhill Fire Station Design-Build Proposal to Domm Construction Ltd. at a total cost of \$1,613,841.34 after the H.S.T rebate; and,
2. provide 2023 pre-budget approval in the amount of \$188,841.34 to fund the budget deficit.

Background:

Existing Conditions

Maryhill Fire Station, originally constructed in 1966, is located at 17 St. Charles Street East, Maryhill. The facility has received two additions since construction, completed in 1977 and 1986 to accommodate the current complement of 25 volunteers. The station has received limited capital investment throughout its useful life, with work limited to repairs and maintenance. In anticipation of major capital investment, asset replacements and enhancements such as roof replacements, slab foundation repairs, and renovations have been deferred.

The design of the existing station accommodates 3 apparatuses, a small meeting room, two offices, and a washroom. The station does not meet the functional needs of the department or current fire station design best practice. For example, the facility does not

contain a bunker gear room, showers and adequate washroom facilities, or appropriate ventilation. There has also been a transition from three to two apparatuses in the fleet, with Staff currently utilizing a bay as their bunker gear room.

Renovation Design

In 2011, a feasibility study was completed by Somfay Masri Architects Inc. to assess the existing facility conditions, including structural, electrical, and mechanical building systems. The study indicated renovation of the facility was the preferred course of action. In 2019, Staff consulted with a local design-build contractor to confirm the approach.

As a part of 2020 and 2021 capital budget deliberations, Staff recommended renovating the facility. Renovation objectives included re-working the existing space to accommodate washrooms, bunker room, meeting and office space, as well as an addition to accommodate the recent purchase of a pumper tanker fire apparatus.

Staff issued a Request for Proposal (RFP) for Design Services for Renovation of the Maryhill Fire Station on November 6th, 2020. The RFP was awarded to G. Douglas Vallee Inc. (Vallee). Throughout 2021, Staff worked with Vallee to design a renovation of the existing facility that incorporated functional requirements of the department. Based on a project estimate provided by Vallee, Staff anticipated additional funding would be required. Staff presented a total budget of \$1,400,000 during 2022 budget deliberations to account for the anticipated cost increase.

On November 25th, 2021, Tender 2021-31 Maryhill Fire Station Renovations and Addition was issued. Staff received eight bid submissions with the lowest compliant bid being \$1,787,520 after the H.S.T. rebate.

Design-Build Replacement

Through discussions with Fire Staff following the tender closing and with Council during 2022 budget deliberations, and based on the costing received for the renovation, it was determined that a new construction may better serve the functional needs of the department and provide greater value.

As a result, Staff recommend that Council support foregoing the award of Tender 2021-31 for renovation of Maryhill Fire Station through Report R02-2022, directing Staff to issue an RFP for construction of a new facility through a design-build process, and authorize Staff to retain Vallee Architects for the development of a RFP and for project administration, with an upset limit of \$70,000 plus H.S.T. The shift in approach would utilize a design-build construction process versus the previous design-bid-build process. Of note, design-builds are often a more cost-effective solution, however, result in a straightforward facility design.

Comments:

In coordination with Vallee, Staff developed an RFP for design-build construction of a new fire station, incorporating both functional design elements previously established through the original renovation design as well as various other building system requirements. The scope provided minimum requirements for facility spaces, including size and preferred locations as well as finish specifications for all interior and exterior elements, including items such as ceiling, framing, fixtures, exterior façade, doors, windows, and more. Additionally, site requirements were provided for septic design, landscaping, and parking.

The intent through the design-build RFP process was to provide minimum requirements to ensure the needs of the department are met, standards for Township building finishes are achieved, all building, fire, and other codes are followed, and the project and budget is all encompassing. Proponents are then required to submit designs which include a floorplan, exterior building drawing, site plan, finish schedule, etc. The Township utilizes a two-envelope evaluation system, whereby proposals are scored based on Approach and Methodology, Experience and References, and Schedule prior to reviewing Financial Proposals.

Staff issued RFP 2022-13 Maryhill Fire Station Design-Build Proposal on April 4th, 2022. Following closing, the Township received proposals from Domm Construction Ltd. and Frey Building Contractors.

Evaluation

An evaluation committee consisting of Finance, Fire, and Recreation and Community Services staff evaluated the proposals using an approved rating system comprised of the following areas:

Approach and Methodology	30%
Experience and References	25%
Schedule	15%
Financial Proposal	30%
	100%

Following evaluation and review of the proposals, Domm Construction Ltd. (Domm) received the highest overall score.

The proposed design submitted by Domm includes a 5,153 square foot fire station that incorporates functional design elements requested through the RFP, including space, building finishes, mechanical systems, and architectural design requirements.

The proposed schedule includes a construction start date in August 2022 with completion in February 2023.

Staff have completed reference checks and are satisfied with those provided.

Interdepartmental Impacts:

Maryhill Fire Station operations will be required to relocate services during the demolition and construction phases of the project, from approximately August 2022 to March 2023. A plan for the relocation of operations and continuation of service will be managed by Fire Staff.

Financial Impacts:

Funding for this project is allocated from the Canada Community Building Fund, Property/Building Reserve Fund, Development Charges, and Infrastructure Reserve Fund.

Budget **\$1,425,000.00**

Tender

Domm Construction Ltd.	\$1,507,415.00
Plus H.S.T	\$195,963.95
Sub Total	\$1,703,378.95
Less H.S.T Rebate	\$170,390.42
Total	\$1,533,945.50

\$1,533,945.50

Other Costs

Consulting Services	\$71,232.00
Front Entrance Roof Awning	\$4,674.85
Fire Alarm System	\$3,988.99
Total	\$79,895.84

\$79,895.84

Grand Total	\$1,613,841.34
Budget Deficit	(\$188,841.34)

The following items required through the RFP specifications were absent from Domm's proposal:

- Plumbing scope including water softener, cistern pump, mop sink, etc.
- Commercial-grade aluminum windows (vinyl proposed)
- IT cabling
- Mezzanine
- Parking lot paving

Furthermore, in the absence of and as an alternative to the front entrance vestibule that was requested through the RFP, Staff have obtained costing for a front entrance roof awning. Staff have also obtained costing to include a fire alarm system.

The above items have been included in the grand total budget along with cash allowances for furniture, bunker gear room lockers, and building signage, as well as provisional items including a washer, dryer, and stand-by generator.

Staff recommend that the \$188,841.34 budget deficit be offset through 2023 pre-budget approval utilizing Infrastructure Reserve funds and Development Charges.

Strategic Plan Impacts:

Optimize the Use of Municipal Infrastructure: Manage and maintain all municipal infrastructure with an emphasis on continuous improvement and greater efficiencies.

Provide Exceptional Customer Service & Commit to Maintaining High Standards for Municipal Service Delivery: Maintain a high standard of municipal service delivery.

Conclusion:

Staff recommend that Council approve awarding Request for Proposal 2022-13 Maryhill Fire Station Design-Build Proposal to Domm Construction Ltd. at a total cost of \$1,613,841.34 after the H.S.T rebate, and provide 2023 pre-budget approval in the amount of \$188,841.34 to fund the budget deficit.

Attachments:

Appendix A – Proposed Exterior

Appendix B – Proposed Site Plan

Appendix C – Proposed Floor Plan